



Disparity in the Verdict of Prosecutors Corruption Crime Case of Pinagki Sirna Malasari and Hasti Sriwahyuni in Based on the Perspective of Donald Black's Legal Theory

Asep Nandang¹, Zudan Arief Fakrulloh²

¹ Universitas Borobudur, Indonesia

² Universitas Borobudur, Indonesia

Corresponding Author: Asep Nandang, E-mail: asepnandang424@gmail.com

Received: Sep 19, 2024	Revised: Sep 22, 2024	Accepted: October 25, 2024	Online: October 27, 2024
------------------------	-----------------------	----------------------------	--------------------------

ABSTRACT

Indonesia is a country of law (Rechtsstaat) not a country of power (Machtstaat). Therefore, it must be the Commander, the law is not a tool of the ruler or businessman, the law does not belong to the ruler or businessman, as mandated by the 5th principle of Pancasila, "Social Justice for All Indonesian People". "Equality before the law" all are equal before the law, no discrimination is the hope of all Indonesian people. On the other hand, corruption creates social inequality, the distance between the rich and the poor is getting further, and corruption has hampered development and social welfare. Corruption will continue to grow until the justice system can punish perpetrators of crimes and keep government authority under control. When justice is "bought" or intervened politically, the people are the victims who suffer. Das solen and das sein are two very different things, the law that is aspired to, the ideal law with the reality in society, the law that should occur in society with the law that occurs in society there is a disparity. Legal discrimination is a serious obstacle in upholding justice according to the expectations of the community, the perpetrators of corruption will continue to increase and increase and will not have a deterrent effect, if there are no concrete efforts to eradicate corruption. Leaders must pay serious attention and guarantee the independence of institutions that enforce the law to eradicate corruption. Now is the right time to end impunity for corruption.

Keywords: Corruption Crime, Donald Black's, Legal Theory

Journal Homepage <https://journal.ypidathu.or.id/index.php/politicae>

This is an open access article under the CC BY SA license

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>

How to cite: Nandang, A., & Fakrulloh, A, Z., (2024). Disparity in the Verdict of Prosecutors Corruption Crime Case of Pinagki Sirna Malasari and Hasti Sriwahyuni in Based on the Perspective of Donald Black's Legal Theory. *Cognitionis Civitatis et Politicae*, 1(5), 368 - 381. <https://doi.org/10.70177/politicae.v1i5.1633>

Published by: Yayasan Pendidikan Islam Daarut Thufulah

INTRODUCTION

Corruption has been proven to weaken democracy and access to justice (Buckner et al., 2023). The narrowing of public participation space due to a corrupt system has exacerbated welfare achievement (Kar et al., 2022). Corruption is also a cause for citizens to access justice. Corruption in Indonesia has developed in 3 (three) stages, namely elitist,

endemic, and systematic: In the elitist stage, corruption is still a social pathology that is typical of the elite/official environment (B. Li et al., 2022). At the endemic stage, corruption is widespread and reaches the wider community (Pyo, 2021). Then at the critical stage, when corruption becomes systemic, every individual in the system is infected with the same disease. The disease of corruption in Indonesia has reached the systematic stage (Cugu et al., 2022). Criminal acts violate the social and economic rights of the community so criminal acts of corruption can no longer be classified as ordinary crimes (Sari et al., 2021). Corruption will continue to develop until the justice system can punish the perpetrators and keep government authority under control. When justice is “bought” or politically intervened, the people are the victims who suffer. Leaders must pay serious attention and ensure the independence of law enforcement institutions to eradicate corruption. Now is the right time to end impunity for corruption (Mattar, 2022).

Corruption Perception Index 2023 or Corruption Perception Index (CPI) Indonesia as one of the major democratic countries in 2024 will hold simultaneous general elections. In the last five years, Indonesia’s CPI has tended to decline (Nyberg, 2021). In 2019 with a score of 40 and then plunged to 34 in 2022 (MacKenzie-Shalders et al., 2022). This is different from Denmark (90), Finland (87), and New Zealand (85) which are at the top of the index this year. Due to their well-functioning judicial systems, these countries are also among the top rankings in the Rule of Law Index (Chen et al., 2022). In addition, strong democratic institutions and great respect for human rights also make these countries the most peaceful countries in the world according to the Global Peace Index (Yap et al., 2022). Indonesia’s Corruption Perception Index or CPI score stagnated, at 34 in 2014 and 2023 (Delfouf et al., 2022). With this stagnation, Indonesia’s ranking dropped from 110 to 115 out of 180 countries (Armstrong et al., 2022). This score places Indonesia far below Singapore, followed by Malaysia, Vietnam, and Thailand. Also read: FACT CHECK: Anies Says Indonesia’s Corruption Perception Index Drops to 34 Sequentially, Singapore’s CPI score was at 83 in 2023, stagnant compared to last year (Reinders Folmer, 2021). Followed by Malaysia with a score of 50, Timor Leste with a score of 43, Vietnam with a score of 41, and Thailand with a score of 35 (Chadee et al., 2021). Other ASEAN countries that are on the same score or below Indonesia are the Philippines with a score of 34, Laos with a score of 28, Cambodia with 22, and Myanmar with 20 (Fijnaut & Huberts, 2000).

Das solen and das sein are not the same, even das solen which is a rule, a regulation (Batista Pereira, 2021), is very different from das sein which is an implementation of das solen, even deviating far (Sismondo, 2021). This is in line with Donald Black’s theory of legal discrimination in the book “Behavior of Law” (Mhaske et al., 2021). Legal discrimination is a serious obstacle in upholding justice according to the expectations of the community (Tang et al., 2023), perpetrators of corruption will continue to increase and increase and will not have a deterrent effect (Mardin et al., 2022), if there are no concrete efforts to eradicate corruption (Bolotskaya & Hager, 2022). Based on the background above, the ideals of the nation’s founders, namely to eradicate poverty and social justice for all Indonesian people (Mathur et al., 2021), are increasingly far from expectations

(Rees et al., 2022). Thus, this paper aims to determine whether there is discrimination in law enforcement of two corruption crimes but with different decisions which are reviewed through Donald Black's legal discrimination theory (X. Li et al., 2021).

LITERATURE REVIEW

Understanding the Criminal Act of Corruption

Corruption comes from the Latin *corruptio* or *corruptus*. *Corruptio* has various meanings, namely the act of damaging or destroying. *Corruptio* is also interpreted as rottenness, ugliness, depravity, dishonesty, can be bribed, immoral, deviation from holiness, insulting, or slanderous words or statements. The word *corruptio* entered the English language as the word *corruption* or in Dutch became *corruptie*. The word *corruptie* in Dutch entered the Indonesian treasury as *corruption*. According to the Great Dictionary of the Indonesian Language (KBBI), corruption is the misappropriation or misuse of state money (companies, organizations, foundations, and so on) for personal or other people's benefit. Another definition of corruption was given by the World Bank in 2000, namely "corruption is the abuse of public power for personal gain". This World Bank definition has become the international standard in formulating corruption.

Corruption, as defined by Law No. 31 of 1999 concerning the Eradication of Criminal Acts of Corruption, involves any unlawful act committed to enrich oneself, others, or a corporation in a manner that harms state finances or the national economy. To qualify as corruption, three key elements must be met. First, there must be an unlawful act, which refers to actions that violate existing legal provisions or principles of justice. Second, the act must result in the enrichment of an individual, group, or corporation, whether directly or indirectly. This enrichment often occurs at the expense of public resources or through the abuse of authority. Third, the act must cause harm to state finances or the country's economy, which includes misappropriation of public funds or actions that undermine economic stability and public welfare. These three interconnected elements form the foundation for identifying and prosecuting corruption under Indonesian law.

Unlawfully

Based on the explanation of Article 2 paragraph (1) of Law Number 31 of 1999 in conjunction with Law Number 20 of 2001 concerning Amendments to Law Number 31 of 1999 concerning the Eradication of Criminal Acts of Corruption, throughout the phrase: What is meant by "unlawfully" includes unlawful acts in both the formal and material sense, namely, even though the act is not regulated in statutory regulations, if the act is considered reprehensible because it does not conform to the sense of justice or the norms of social life in society, then the act can be punished. This is stated to not have binding legal force on the basis of the consideration that the concept of being against the law is not written in the standards of propriety, caution and precision that exist in society, as a norm of justice is a measure that is not certain and therefore does not comply with the protection and guarantee of fair legal certainty as contained in Article 28 letter d paragraph (1) of the 1945 Constitution.

That in criminal law, the definition of “against the law” (*wederrechtelijk*) is known as contrary to the law, contrary to the rights of others, without one’s rights. In the context of the provisions of Article 2 of Law Number 31 of 1999 concerning the Eradication of Criminal Acts of Corruption as amended and supplemented by Law Number 20 of 2001 concerning Amendments to Law Number 31 of 1999 concerning the Eradication of Criminal Acts of Corruption, Prof. DR (Jur.) Andi Hamzah in his book *Eradication of Corruption Through National and International Criminal Law* Publisher PT Raja Grafindo Persada, Jakarta. 2005 page 129 argues “In the crime of corruption, especially Article 2 of the 1999 PTKP Law, “the most appropriate definition to use is “against the law” as not having one’s right to enjoy the benefits (of corruption).

Enriching Oneself or Another Person or a Corporation

In the Corruption Law does not expressly explain the phrase “Enriching Oneself or Another Person or a Corporation”, but the author emphasizes the phrase based on the decision of the Panel of Judges of the Indramayu District Court in its decision Number 387/Pid.Sus/2010/PN.Im dated March 8, 2011, which provides an interpretation of this element which can be quoted as follows: “Considering that the law does not explain what enriching oneself, another person, or a corporation is. Enriching oneself, another person, or a corporation can be interpreted as an intention by someone to do something with the aim that the wealth of the perpetrator, another person, or a corporation increases.”

The element of enriching oneself, another person, or a corporation must fulfill the element of “intention”, to enrich oneself or another person or a corporation where the wealth “increases”.

Harming State Finances or the State Economy

State financial losses, as defined by Article 1 of Law No. 17 of 2003 concerning State Finance, encompass all state rights and obligations that can be valued in monetary terms, as well as all forms of money or goods owned by the state in connection with the execution of these rights and obligations. These state finances include all state assets, whether separated or not, along with the entirety of state-owned properties and the associated rights and obligations. The scope of these finances covers assets under the control, management, and accountability of state institution officials at both central and regional levels. Furthermore, state finances also include assets managed by State-Owned Enterprises (SOEs), Regional-Owned Enterprises (ROEs), foundations, legal entities, and companies that incorporate state capital. This extends to enterprises that involve third-party capital based on agreements with the state. These provisions ensure that all financial activities involving state assets are conducted with accountability and transparency, reflecting the state’s commitment to effective and responsible management of public resources.

Meanwhile, what is meant by the State Economy is economic life which is structured as a joint effort based on the principle of family or independent community efforts which are based on Government policies, both at the central and regional levels in accordance with the provisions of applicable laws and regulations which aim to provide benefits, prosperity and welfare to the entire life of the people.

Legal Discrimination Theory Based on Donald Black's Thoughts

Social Stratification

It is vertical differences in social life such as differences in social status in the economic field, or social ranking in society. Social stratification is a hierarchy or layering that exists in society caused by differences in status, position, wealth, and others;

Social Morphology

It is a horizontal difference in society due to differences in profession, familiarity or intimacy, and integration. The Relationship between Law and Differentiation is Curvilinear, namely that humans who get more differences in social strata, the number increases and vice versa. The Relationship between Law and Relational Distance Curvilinear, namely that the law does not apply to people who have close relationships. So the law grows along with the distance or distance. Law Varies Directly with Integration, namely that people in the center of the social circle have more laws than people in the outer social circle (marginal) or also called centrifugal law.

Culture

It is symbolic aspects, such as what is good and bad (religion), including works and folklore. Law Varies Directly with Culture, namely, a society with a high level of culture has more laws. For example, nomadic tribes do not have as many laws as societies with a high culture. Law is Greater in a Direction Toward Less Conventionality than More Conventionality, namely crimes committed by minority groups and the victims are from the majority, therefore the punishment will be heavier and vice versa. For example, the perpetrator of the crime is a black person and the victim is a white person. Law is Greater Toward Less Culture than Toward More Culture, namely having the meaning of a crime committed by an uncultured or low-educated person against a cultured or highly educated person, the punishment received will be heavier than the perpetrator is a highly educated person against an uneducated or low-educated person. Centrifugal Law is Greater than Centripetal Law, namely the meaning that a crime committed by a marginal or unemployed person against a person in the center of the social circle or in a prominent position will receive a heavy punishment, and vice versa.

Organizational structure

That legal behavior is influenced by organizations. Organizations here include countries, governments, companies, political parties, and other state institutions. Law Varies Directly with Organization, which means that the more state intervention or interference in society, the more laws are used. Law is Greater in Direction Toward Less Organization than Toward More Organization, which means that law is more directed towards humans than organizations, more organizations report individuals to the police than individuals report an organization to the police, and organizations win cases in court more often than individuals.

Social Control

It is the normative aspect of social life. Things that can control behavior that deviates from the law and norms, such as prohibitions, charges, and punishment. Law Varies Inversely with Other Social Control, if social control is strong then legal control is

weakened, and vice versa. Law Varies Directly with Respectability means that law is more often found in elite society than in non-elite society, such as vagrants, and beggars. Law is Greater in a Direction Toward Less Respectability than Toward More Respectability, that dishonorable society is more often used as the target of law and tends not to get the benefits of the law itself.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Prosecutor Pinangki Sirna Malasari's case

- a. Prosecutor Pinangki Sirna Malasari in the Corruption Court Decision at the Central Jakarta District Court dated February 8, 2021 Number 38/PID.SUS-TPK/2020/PN JKT.PST with a sentence of 10 (ten) years imprisonment with a fine of Rp600,000,000.00 (six hundred million rupiah), with the provision that if the fine is not paid it will be replaced with imprisonment for 6 (six) months;
- b. Prosecutor Pinangki Sirna Malasari made an Appeal Legal Effort with the Decision of the JAKARTA High Court Number 10/PID.TPK/2021/PT DKI June 14, 2021, with a sentence of 4 (four) years imprisonment with a fine of Rp600,000,000.00 (six hundred million rupiah), with the provision that if the fine is not paid it will be replaced with imprisonment for 6 (six) months (Deroy et al., 2021).

Based on the legal facts above, the Jakarta High Court Decision has cut, and reduced the prison sentence from the Central Jakarta District Court decision of 10 years to 4 years (Phan Thanh, 2024), it is already public knowledge that in the case of an appeal decision in favor of the Defendant, the Public Prosecutor immediately firmly took legal action for cassation at the Supreme Court (MA), out of the ordinary and somewhat “strange”, the Public Prosecutor did not take legal action for cassation and allowed the decision to become Permanent Legal Force (BHT) (Ahmed et al., 2021). As we know, Attorney Pinangki Sirna Malasari 2011 served as a functional prosecutor in the field of Civil State Administration (Datun), 2012 Pinangki served as a functional prosecutor in the Supervision Sector, in 2014 Pinangki served as echelon 4 as Head of Sub-Directorate of Statistics and Analysis at the Center for Criminal Data and Statistics Information (Pusdakrimti) of the Attorney General's Office, then in 2016 served as Head of Sub-Division of Monitoring and Evaluation at the Planning Bureau at the Attorney General's Office (Pistone et al., 2023).

The Case of Hasti Sriwahyuni

Chronology of Hasti Sriwahyuni's Legal Case

1. HASTI SRIWAHYUNI is the Beneficial Owner of PT. PRIORITAS RADITYA MULTI FINANCE (PRM) which issued Medium Term Notes (MTN) under the name Medium Term Notes Prioritas Finance 2017 Principal Amount of Rp.150,000,000,000,- (one hundred and fifty billion rupiah);
 2. PT. PRIORITAS RADITYA MULTI FINANCE (PRM) is the issuer, while PT. Bang Mega, Tbk is the trustee and collateral agent, where to issue the MTN, PT. PRM pledged 3 plots of land located in Solo with a value equivalent to the MTN value, namely Rp.150,000,000,000,- (one hundred and fifty billion rupiah);
-

-
3. That PT. Taspen Life is the holder of MTN or an investor worth Rp. 150,000,000,000,- (one hundred and fifty billion rupiah);
 4. At maturity, PT.PRM has failed to pay, based on the agreement with the investor, agreed to sell the land that was pledged and the shortfall sold the land located in Cileungsi to cover the debt to the Investor through PT.Bank Mega, Tbk as the Trustee and Jaiman agent;
 5. Both Bank Mega, Tbk, and PT. Taspen Life has stated that PT.PRM in a statement letter, that PT.PRM has paid off its debt.
 6. the audit of the Republic of Indonesia Audit Board Based on the Audit Result Report of the Republic of Indonesia BPK No.15 / AUDITAMA / VII / PDTT / 02/2019 dated February 12, 2019, stated that for the settlement of PT PRM's MTN there was a shortfall of Rp. 388,000,000,-;
 7. That for the shortfall, PT PRM has made a payment of Rp. 388,000,000,- to PT Asuransi Jiwa Taspen, so that the obligation for the issuance of MTN PT PRM has been paid off in accelerated payment.
 8. Along the way, Hasti Sriwahyuni was summoned by the Attorney General's Office on suspicion of corruption that harmed the state and was finally submitted to the Central Jakarta District Court (Warguła & Kaczmarzyk, 2022).

Multi-Level Court Decisions

1. Corruption Crime Decision at the Central Jakarta District Court July 2013, Number 73/PID.SUS-TPK/2022/PN.Jkt.Pst which was decided on February 23, 2023, Hasti Sriwahyuni with the verdict: With a prison sentence of 8 (eight) years and a fine of Rp. 1,000,000,000, - (one billion rupiah) with the provision that if the fine is not paid, it is replaced with imprisonment for 6 (six) months, with additional punishment for the Defendant to pay replacement money of Rp. 128,536,628,899.00 (one hundred twenty-eight billion five hundred thirty-six million six hundred twenty-eight thousand eight hundred ninety-nine rupiah), if the Convict does not have sufficient assets, then he will be punished with imprisonment for 3 (three) years;
2. Hasti Sriwahyuni made an appeal to the Jakarta High Court Number: 20/PID.SUS.TPK/2023/PT.DKI, dated May 25, 2023, with a verdict confirming the decision of the Corruption Court of the Central District Court;
3. To obtain justice because Hasti Sriwahyuni had paid off her debt to PT. Taspen Life made an appeal to the Supreme Court, namely the Jakarta High Court Number: 20/PID.SUS.TPK/2023/PT.DKI, dated May 25, 2023, but the cassation decision: her application was rejected.

Disparity of Legal Decisions and Legal Treatment in the Perception of Legal Discrimination Theory

Based on the theory of legal discrimination in the book "Behaviour of Law" by Donald Black, elements of social stratification, social morphology, organizational structure, but not including culture and elements of social control. The author will explain more clearly in the next chapter.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Analysis Based on Social Stratification Theory

Vertical differences in social life such as differences in social status in the economic field, or social ranking in society (Miyata et al., 2023). Social stratification is a hierarchy or layering that exists in society caused by differences in status, position, wealth, and others (Vidulin et al., 2024). Pinangki is a prosecutor, as a law enforcer, and has high social strata, especially in Indonesia, a developing country heading towards take-off, legal apparatus has a high position, while Hasti Sriwahyuni is not an official or ASN, not a state apparatus or law enforcer, she is an ordinary civilian, an entrepreneur, where her life does not depend on the state (Abbasi Mojdehi & Ali Zarei, 2023).

The legal treatment and legal decisions are different, although both were proven to have committed a criminal act of corruption, Prosecutor Pinangki received a sentence reduction from the Central District Court's decision, 10 years to 4 years by the Jakarta High Court's decision, the decision was reduced by 60% and the Public Prosecutor did not file an appeal (Wu et al., 2021). Hasti Sriwahyuni's decision, even though in the trial facts all the factual witnesses explained that the debt had been paid off and did not cause any state losses, the decision of the Corruption Crime Court of the Central District Court sentenced her to 8 years in prison and a tiered legal effort, both the Jakarta High Court decision upheld the decision of the Central District Court as well as the cassation decision, the cassation application was rejected (Cortese et al., 2023).

Analysis Based on Social Morphology Theory

Horizontal differences in society due to differences in profession, familiarity or intimacy, and integration (Wang et al., 2024). The Relationship between Law and Relational Distance is Curvilinear, namely the law does not apply to people who have close relationships (Parasuraman & Mohanavel, 2021). So the law grows together with the distance or distance. Law Varies Directly with Integration, namely people in the central social circle have more laws than people in the outer social circle (marginal) also called centrifugal law (Zhang & Xin, 2023). The relationship between legal structures, namely the relationship between Legal Agencies or legal entities, both between the district court and the district attorney and/or the police, is a working relationship, as well as between fellow law enforcers coordinating with each other which creates intimacy, familiarity, and integration.

First, the internal relationship of the prosecutor's office, between the public prosecutor and his team with Pinangki is one agency, colleague, or colleague in one circle that creates a common corps spirit, creates an emotional relationship, familiarity, and part of the integration, he emphasized Law Varies Directly with Integration, namely, the community in the central social circle has more law than the community in the outer social circle (marginal) or also called centrifugal law. Pinaki is a prosecutor and the public prosecutor is the same part of one organization, namely the Prosecutor's Office, the Panel of Judges and the Substitute Clerk are part of the judicial system together with the prosecutor's office, in everyday life they often meet in court, creating familiarity and

intimacy, different from advocates who accompany their clients, not always meeting with the public prosecutor or the Panel of Judges (Tian et al., 2022). Pinangki is a prosecutor, Hasti Sriwahyuni is an ordinary person, not from the circle of the judicial system (Tian et al., 2022).

Second, the relationship between legal structures is an integrated working relationship, coordination that creates emotional relationships, fellow law enforcers, and familiarity, Law Varies Directly with Integration. The legal treatment and legal decisions are different, although both were proven to have committed corruption, the prosecutor Pinangki received a sentence reduction from the Central District Court's decision, 10 years to 4 years by the Jakarta High Court's decision, the decision was reduced by 60% and the prosecutor did not file an appeal. Hasti Sriwahyuni's decision in the Central District Court's Corruption Crimes Court decision sentenced her to 8 years in prison and a tiered legal effort, both the Jakarta High Court's decision upheld the Central District Court's decision as well as the cassation decision, her cassation request was rejected.

Analysis Based on Cultural Theory

The disparity in the case of Prosecutor Pinangki Sirna Malasari and the Decision in the Hasti Sriwahyuni Case is not included in this element, therefore the Author does not discuss it.

Analysis Based on the Theory of Organizational Structure or Legal Behavior Influenced by the Organization

The organizations in question are the state, government including the Prosecutor's Office and the Police, the Judicial Body, companies, political parties, and other institutions. Law Varies Directly with Organization, namely the more intervention or interference the state has in society, the more laws there are. In the case of Pinangki, there was interference from the Prosecutor's Office, this can be seen in the decision of the DKI High Court which reduced the decision of the Corruption Court of the Central District Court from 10 years to five years and the Public Prosecutor (JPU) did not file an appeal. This is different from the Hasti Sriwahyuni case, not from a government organization or other institution, the judicial process is normative (Na et al., 2022).

Analysis Based on Social Control Theory

The disparity in the case of Prosecutor Pinangki Sirna Malasari and the decision in the case of Hasti Sriwahyuni is not included in this element, therefore the Author does not discuss it.

CONCLUSION

From the discussion above, it can be concluded that legal discrimination is injustice by law enforcement officers, disparity in court decisions and different legal treatment between the Pinangki and Hasti Sriwahyuni cases is legal discrimination based on Donald

Black's theory which fulfills the elements of Social Strata, Social Morphology and Organizational Structure.

The social morphology that fosters familiarity, intimacy, and integration between the court and the prosecutor's office creates relational dynamics that can hinder impartiality and fairness in judicial processes. The curvilinear relationship between law and relational distance demonstrates that the law often fails to be applied objectively when close relationships exist between parties involved in the legal process. To address this issue, several measures are proposed to ensure justice and transparency. Firstly, the inclusion of two ad hoc judges in corruption cases alongside one career judge would provide a balanced perspective and reduce potential biases. Secondly, implementing a rotation or transfer policy for judges every six months would prevent the development of close relationships that compromise impartiality. Additionally, substitute clerks, who often serve as intermediaries between the panel of judges and the prosecutor, should also be rotated every six months to maintain professional boundaries and reduce undue influence. Finally, revising the Judicial Law to align with societal dynamics and public expectations for fairness and justice is essential. These reforms aim to uphold judicial integrity, enhance accountability, and restore public trust in the legal system.

REFERENCES

- Abbasi Mojdehi, H., & Ali Zarei, A. (2023). Vertical Grammatical Variability in Writing: Does Scaffolding Make a Difference? *BELT - Brazilian English Language Teaching Journal*, 14(1), e44578. <https://doi.org/10.15448/2178-3640.2023.1.44578>
- Ahmed, R. K., Muhammed, K. H., Qadir, A. O., Arif, S. I., Lips, S., Nyman-Metcalf, K., Pappel, I., & Draheim, D. (2021). A Legal Framework for Digital Transformation: A Proposal Based on a Comparative Case Study. In A. Kö, E. Francesconi, G. Kotsis, A. M. Tjoa, & I. Khalil (Eds.), *Electronic Government and the Information Systems Perspective* (Vol. 12926, pp. 115–128). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-86611-2_9
- Armstrong, B., Barnes, T. D., O'Brien, D. Z., & Taylor-Robinson, M. M. (2022). Corruption, Accountability, and Women's Access to Power. *The Journal of Politics*, 84(2), 1207–1213. <https://doi.org/10.1086/715989>
- Batista Pereira, F. (2021). Do Female Politicians Face Stronger Backlash for Corruption Allegations? Evidence from Survey-Experiments in Brazil and Mexico. *Political Behavior*, 43(4), 1561–1580. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11109-020-09602-9>
- Bolotskaya, E., & Hager, B. H. (2022). A 1D Spring-Slider Model with a Simple Poly-Linear Failure Law Produces Rich Variations in Slip Behavior. *Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America*, 112(6), 2795–2811. <https://doi.org/10.1785/0120220052>
- Buckner, Z., Martin, S., Norris, K., & Walker, D. (2023). Does Procedural Justice Matter in Probation? Investigating the Relationship Between Procedural Just Treatment and Law-Abiding Behavior Among a Sample of High-Risk Offenders. *Crime & Delinquency*, 00111287231211265. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00111287231211265>
-

-
- Chadee, D., Roxas, B., & Kouznetsov, A. (2021). Corruption, Bribery and Innovation in CEE: Where is the Link? *Journal of Business Ethics*, 174(4), 747–762. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-021-04925-x>
- Chen, C., Wang, Q., Wang, H., Ding, H., Hu, W., Xie, W., Weng, P., Jiang, L., & Yin, X. (2022). Contact Unloading Behaviors of Elastic-Power-Law Strain Hardening Material Considering Indenter Elasticity Effect. *Journal of Tribology*, 144(12), 121501. <https://doi.org/10.1115/1.4055028>
- Cortese, L., Jensen, D. J., Simard, M., & Fagherazzi, S. (2023). Using Normalize Difference Vegetation Index to Infer Wetlands Salinity and Organic Contribution to Vertical Accretion Rates. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Biogeosciences*, 128(11), e2023JG007631. <https://doi.org/10.1029/2023JG007631>
- Cugu, I., Mancini, M., Chen, Y., & Akata, Z. (2022). Attention Consistency on Visual Corruptions for Single-Source Domain Generalization. *2022 IEEE/CVF Conference on Computer Vision and Pattern Recognition Workshops (CVPRW)*, 4164–4173. <https://doi.org/10.1109/CVPRW56347.2022.00461>
- Delfouf, R., Bouzit, N., Bourouba, N., Brahimi, A., & Jiménez, J. P. M. (2022). Dielectric Behavior Investigation of Composite Materials Based on Epoxy Resin/Fe₃ O₄ /CaTiO₃ , SrTiO₃ Using Mixture Laws. *ECS Journal of Solid State Science and Technology*, 11(9), 093003. <https://doi.org/10.1149/2162-8777/ac8ed1>
- Deroy, A., Bhattacharya, P., Ghosh, K., & Ghosh, S. (2021). An Analytical Study of Algorithmic and Expert Summaries of Legal Cases. In E. Schweighofer (Ed.), *Frontiers in Artificial Intelligence and Applications*. IOS Press. <https://doi.org/10.3233/FAIA210322>
- Fijnaut, C., & Huberts, L. (2000). Corruption, Integrity and Law Enforcement. In C. J. C. F. Fijnaut & L. Huberts (Eds.), *Corruption, Integrity and Law Enforcement* (pp. 3–34). Brill | Nijhoff. https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004481213_002
- Kar, O. F., Yeo, T., Atanov, A., & Zamir, A. (2022). 3D Common Corruptions and Data Augmentation. *2022 IEEE/CVF Conference on Computer Vision and Pattern Recognition (CVPR)*, 18941–18952. <https://doi.org/10.1109/CVPR52688.2022.01839>
- Li, B., Liu, X., Hu, P., Wu, Z., Lv, J., & Peng, X. (2022). All-In-One Image Restoration for Unknown Corruption. *2022 IEEE/CVF Conference on Computer Vision and Pattern Recognition (CVPR)*, 17431–17441. <https://doi.org/10.1109/CVPR52688.2022.01693>
- Li, X., Geng, J., Li, Q., Tian, W., & Zhou, T. (2021). Behaviors and Overlying Strata Failure Law for Underground Filling of a Gently Inclined Medium-Thick Phosphate Deposit. *Advances in Civil Engineering*, 2021(1), 3275525. <https://doi.org/10.1155/2021/3275525>
- MacKenzie-Shalders, K. L., Lee, K. W., Wright, C., Dulla, J., Tsoi, A., & Orr, R. M. (2022). Dietary Intake in Law Enforcement Personnel: Occupation Is an Additional Challenge for Changing Behavior. *Nutrients*, 14(7), 1336. <https://doi.org/10.3390/nu14071336>
-

-
- Mardin, N., Purnamasari, A. I., Miqat, N., Kharismawan, A., & Nur, R. (2022). Comparative Law Study: Sentencing of Sexual Violence Perpetrators Who have Deviant Sexual Behavior. *Jambura Law Review*, 4(2), 227–245. <https://doi.org/10.33756/jlr.v4i2.15132>
- Mathur, P., Mishra, S. R., Bohra, M., Suthar, D. L., & Purohit, S. D. (2021). Computational Behavior of Second Law Poiseuille Flow of Micropolar Fluids in a Channel: Analytical Treatment. *Journal of Mathematics*, 2021, 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.1155/2021/9945319>
- Mattar, M. Y. (2022). Combating Academic Corruption and Enhancing Academic Integrity through International Accreditation Standards: The Model of Qatar University. *Journal of Academic Ethics*, 20(2), 119–146. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10805-021-09392-7>
- Mhaske, P., Farahnaky, A., & Kasapis, S. (2021). 3D Confocal Laser Scanning Microscopy for Quantification of the Phase Behaviour in Agarose-MCC co-gels in Comparison to the Rheological Blending-law Analysis. *Food Biophysics*, 16(2), 153–160. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11483-020-09656-6>
- Miyata, Y., Bono, S., & Konishi, S. (2023). Volume Control of Droplets in Vertical Contact-Separation Process Using Radius Difference of Solid–Liquid Interface on Substrate. *Journal of the Physical Society of Japan*, 92(10), 104802. <https://doi.org/10.7566/JPSJ.92.104802>
- Na, S., Heo, S., Han, S., Shin, Y., & Roh, Y. (2022). Acceptance Model of Artificial Intelligence (AI)-Based Technologies in Construction Firms: Applying the Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) in Combination with the Technology–Organisation–Environment (TOE) Framework. *Buildings*, 12(2), 90. <https://doi.org/10.3390/buildings12020090>
- Nyberg, D. (2021). Corporations, Politics, and Democracy: Corporate political activities as political corruption. *Organization Theory*, 2(1), 2631787720982618. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2631787720982618>
- Parasuraman, L., & Mohanavel, D. (2021). Time-Dependent Nonlinear Finite Difference Analysis of Buoyancy-Driven Convective Flow over an Oscillating Porous Moving Vertical Cylinder. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, India Section A: Physical Sciences*, 91(1), 89–96. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40010-020-00676-y>
- Phan Thanh, T. (2024). Legal Policy Recommendations for Fostering Green Business Development: A Case Study of Enterprises in Vietnam. *Qubahan Academic Journal*, 4(3), 334–346. <https://doi.org/10.48161/qaj.v4n3a836>
- Pistone, V., Sovrano, F., & Distefano, B. (2023). Aligning UN Goals and legal norms in a case weighting system: A case study on environmental crimes in Italy. *Proceedings of the 16th International Conference on Theory and Practice of Electronic Governance*, 324–331. <https://doi.org/10.1145/3614321.3614365>
- Pyo, S. (2021). Do Body-Worn Cameras Change Law Enforcement Arrest Behavior? A National Study of Local Police Departments. *The American Review of Public Administration*, 51(3), 184–198. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0275074020982688>
-

-
- Rees, D. I., Sabia, J. J., & Kumpas, G. (2022). Anti-Bullying Laws and Suicidal Behaviors Among Teenagers. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 41(3), 787–823. <https://doi.org/10.1002/pam.22405>
- Reinders Folmer, C. P. (2021). Crowding-Out Effects of Laws, Policies and Incentives on Compliant Behaviour. In B. Van Rooij & D. D. Sokol (Eds.), *The Cambridge Handbook of Compliance* (1st ed., pp. 326–340). Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108759458.023>
- Sari, T. K., Cahaya, F. R., & Joseph, C. (2021). Coercive Pressures and Anti-corruption Reporting: The Case of ASEAN Countries. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 171(3), 495–511. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-020-04452-1>
- Sismondo, S. (2021). Epistemic Corruption, the Pharmaceutical Industry, and the Body of Medical Science. *Frontiers in Research Metrics and Analytics*, 6, 614013. <https://doi.org/10.3389/frma.2021.614013>
- Tang, L., Biswas, A., Yildirim, Y., & Asiri, A. (2023). Bifurcation Analysis and Chaotic Behavior of the Concatenation Model with Power-Law Nonlinearity. *Contemporary Mathematics*, 1014–1025. <https://doi.org/10.37256/cm.4420233606>
- Tian, Y., Jiang, G., Zhou, D., Zhou, T., & Ma, W. (2022). A Refined Rural Settlements Simulation Considering the Competition Relationship among the Internal Land Use Types: A Case Study of Pinggu District. *Land*, 11(5), 661. <https://doi.org/10.3390/land11050661>
- Vidulin, N., Čačan, R., & Peharec, S. (2024). Vertical Ground Reaction Force-Time Curve Differences Between the Two Landings of a Drop Vertical Jump. Implication For ACL Injury Risk. *Studia Sportiva*, 18(2). <https://doi.org/10.5817/StS2024-2-2>
- Wang, Z., Zhang, L., Mu, L., Hui, Y., Song, W., Li, W., & Hu, D. (2024). Two Types of Intraseasonal Variability With a Vertical Difference in the Currents East of Luzon Island and Their Sources. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans*, 129(11), e2024JC021206. <https://doi.org/10.1029/2024JC021206>
- Warguła, Ł., & Kaczmarzyk, P. (2022). Legal Regulations of Restrictions of Air Pollution Made by Mobile Positive Pressure Fans—The Case Study for Europe: A Review. *Energies*, 15(20), 7672. <https://doi.org/10.3390/en15207672>
- Wu, S., Tang, G., Wang, Y., Mai, R., Yao, D., Kang, Y., Wang, Q., & Wang, Y. (2021). Vertical Evolution of Boundary Layer Volatile Organic Compounds in Summer over the North China Plain and the Differences with Winter. *Advances in Atmospheric Sciences*, 38(7), 1165–1176. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00376-020-0254-9>
- Yap, J. B. H., Lee, K. Y., Rose, T., & Skitmore, M. (2022). Corruption in the Malaysian construction industry: Investigating effects, causes, and preventive measures. *International Journal of Construction Management*, 22(8), 1525–1536. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15623599.2020.1728609>
- Zhang, R., & Xin, Y. (2023). Study on the Effective Well Depth of Single U-Shaped Vertical Buried Pipes Based on Temperature Difference Analysis. *ACS Omega*, 8(28), 24964–24979. <https://doi.org/10.1021/acsomega.3c01207>
-

Copyright Holder :

© Asep Nandang et al. (2024).

First Publication Right :

© Cognitionis Civitatis et Politicae

This article is under:

